UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

JUDY BONN-WITTINGHAM; MELVA JONES: GERMITA FREMONT; MAISIE BECKFORD, LENA BARTON; DULCIE JONES; UNICA GEORGE; GRETA KEISER; ENID LEWIS; MARIE PAULA EUGENE: GLORIA BENT: GRACE YARDE; LINDA HENDERSON; VESTA DOUGLAS; EVELYN CIMA; MERLE HOYTE; OCTAVIA CRICK; ALBERTINA THOMAS; UNICEY DESHIELDS; SUZY DORCE; IMMACULA AUGUSTE; MARY P. EUGENE; ALBERTHA FENELON; PARBATI SINGH; VERNA RICKETTS; GILLIAN BOWEN; FARIL BEST: CORNELIOUS GREEN: MARGARET YOUNGE: GLADYS ENRIQUEZ: OLIVE DUTCHIN: MIGNAN BARRY: SHERAN JAMES; DEBBIE ANN BROWN; PAULINE GRANT; CATHERINE JESSAMY; BEVERELY CALDWELL; IRMA ANDERSON; MARIE AFREH; SHIRLEY EDWARDS; OMODELE JOHNSON; THEMA JAMES; ADALSIE HOUSTON; ROSEANNE CRANDON; CECILIA BEST; MARTHA GROVES; LAUNA JONES; ANGELA ARMSTRONG: IONIE SENIOR: YOLANDE JEAN-BART; MORINE WRIGHT; YVONNE LEWIS; ANITA LUBIN; ELAINE CLARKE; MARIE FLEURIMONT; MARGARET COTTERELL; MARIE YANICK JOSEPH; ELLA POMPEY; MYRNA THOMAS; MARIE-L GILLES; EUNICE STAFFORD; MARIE MILORD; MARIE D. PIERRE; MERLE LOPEZ; BEVERLINE GRANT; ELAINE TAYLOR; LINNETT WILLIAMS; ROXANNE CAMBRIDGE; KATHLENE MORGAN; SAWARIE RAMLOCHAN; ANNE MARIE MORGAN; LEONIE HUSSETT; LINETTE CORNWALL; FAY MCKENZIE; MARIE DORSAINVILLE; CARMEL ANDERSON; YOLANA GAYLE; PAULINE CLARKE; ALVIRA HENRY; JOAN LEACOCK; LYNETTE VYENT; MARIE MONPREMIER; SYLVIA HOYTE: UNA SEALE: LUCY INEUS: LORENTE SIMEON; PEARLINE DONALDSON-REID; BETTYANNE ALEXANDER; OLGA CADET; CARMEN POWNALL; JUDY TAYLOR; LYNETTE A. WILLIAMS; FLORENCE CUVILLY; JEANETTE BRICE; CAROLINE LONG;

MARJORIE JOHNSON; GERDA ANTOINE;

Case No.: 1:16-cv-00541-ARR-JO

REPLY DECLARATION OF KEVIN J. O'CONNOR, ESQ.

LAW OFFICES

Peckar & Abramson

A Professional Corporation

DORETTA THOMAS; WALTERINE LEVIUS; VELDA MAYERS; ELIZA HAMILTON; YVONNE MACK; ISOLYN PALMER; VANETTA GRANT; PATRICIA COSMAS; DONNA HEADLEY; CLAUDETTE GRIMES; SEORAJNI PERSAUD; NEELA WARDEN; EILEEN TUCKER; ANNETTE DAVIS: CARMEN PELZER: ANN SABAL: JACQUELINE ELLIS; JOAN MARAGH; SYLVIA PETERS; JUILETTE HAMILTON; MARIE LAGUERRE; TANISHA GOODEN; IMMACULA DORISMOND; ELSIE COLLINS; BEVERLY ROYAL MCPHERSON; AUDREY CROSDALE; MARIYA SUDNISHNIKOVA; WALENTINA RUSZCZYK; HODA HASSANE; HUGUETTE NELSON; SANDRA MCINTOSH; YVELINE M. BEAUCHAMP; JULIETH MELBOURNE; ADELINE JERMAIN; GISLAINE JOCELYN; MIROSLAWA BARTOLD; MARINA KISSINA; MARINA BESSARABOVA; MARTHE LATOUR; JEANINE ELIE; MARIE LONGUEFOSSE; YPPOLIA DECOPAIN; LUDMILLA ARMONAVICA; ESTHER LOPEZ; JANINA WERLYNSKA; CONSESORA LIRIANO; MARIANELA SORIANO; DIGNA GARCIA; PAULA GARCIA; MERCEDES GARCIA; LIDIYA BERDNKOVA; KRYSTYNA BUNKOWSKA; VITOLD STANKEVICH; ZOIA STANKEVICH; ANATALIE JEAN; ANA M. GOMEZ; CANDIDA PAREDES; MARIE GRAND-PIERRE; ALMA ARIZA; CRYSTAL EDWARDS

Plaintiffs,

on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated

- against -

PROJECT O.H.R. (OFFICE FOR HOMECARE REFERRAL), INC.,; METROPOLITAN NEW YORK COORDINATING COUNCIL ON JEWISH POVERTY; D'VORAH KOHN

Defendants.

LAW OFFICES

Peckar & Abramson

A Professional Corporation

I, **KEVIN J. O'CONNOR**, of full age, hereby declare as follows:

- 1. I am an attorney-at-law of the State of New Jersey and a shareholder with the firm of Peckar & Abramson, P.C., attorneys for Defendants, PROJECT O.H.R. (OFFICE FOR HOMECARE REFERRAL), INC.; METROPOLITAN NEW YORK COORDINATING COUNCIL ON JEWISH POVERTY AND D'VORAH KOHN. (collectively "Defendants") in this matter.
- 2. I submit this Reply Declaration in further support of Defendants' Reply Memorandum of Law in Further Support of Defendants' motion to dismiss the Second Amended Complaint ("SAC") pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(6) and to strike class allegations.
- 3. A copy of Judge Kathy J. King's Order dismissing class allegations, dated January 20, 2016, in the matter styled as Melamed v. Americare Certified Special Serv., Inc., bearing Index Number 503171/2012, is attached hereto as **Exhibit A**.
- 4. A copy of the unpublished decision of <u>Andryeyeva v. New York Health Care, Inc.</u>, 2011 WL 12522345 (Kings Cty., June 20, 2011), is attached hereto as **Exhibit B**.
- 5. A copy of the unpublished decision of A<u>lbunio v. International Safety Group,</u> Inc., 2016 WL 1267795 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 30, 2016), is attached hereto as **Exhibit C**.
- A copy of the unpublished decision of O'Diah v. N.Y.C., 2002 WL 1941179
 (S.D.N.Y. Aug. 21, 2002), is attached hereto as Exhibit D.
- 7. A copy of the unpublished decision of Moreno v. Future Care Health Svs., Inc., 2015 WL 1969753, 2015 N.Y. Slip Op. 31752(U) (Kings Cty. May 4, 2015), is attached hereto as **Exhibit E**.

LAW OFFICES

Peckar & Abramson

A Professional Corporation

Case 1:16-cv-00541-JO Document 38-1 Filed 07/01/16 Page 4 of 4 PageID #: 334

8. A copy of Judge David L. Schmidt's Order dated May 4, 2015 denying class

certification in the matter styled as Moreno v. Future Care Health Svs., Inc., bearing Index

Number 500569/2013 is attached hereto as **Exhibit F**.

9. A copy of the unpublished decision of Motta v. Global Contract Services, Inc.,

2016 WL 2642229 (S.D.N.Y. May 4, 2016), is attached hereto as **Exhibit G**.

I hereby certify that the foregoing statements made by me are true. I am aware that if

any of the foregoing statements made by me are willfully false, I am subject to punishment.

/s/ Kevin J. O'Connor_

KEVIN J. O'CONNOR

Dated: July 1, 2016

LAW OFFICES

Peckar & Abramson

A Professional Corporation

4